RETROSPECTIVE STUDY ON GOVERNMENT POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION OF VOCATIONAL SCHOOL TEACHERS’ PREPARATION PROGRAM BETWEEN INDONESIA AND TAIWAN

Ching-Hua Chiu
Graduate School of Technological and Vocational Education, National Yunlin University of Science and Technology, Taiwan; E-mail: am8586ma@gmail.com

Didik Nurhadi
State University of Malang, Indonesia; E-mail: didiknurhadi.um@gmail.com

Abstract

This research is aimed to compare the government policy and the implementation of preparing the teachers of vocational school in Indonesia and Taiwan. Using a qualitative research, the researchers used some professors from both two countries as the respondents. The result of the research showed that the policy and the implementation of preparing the teachers as held by Indonesia Government are still oriented to the quantity of certified teachers in accordance to the national education standard. Whilst, the policy made by Taiwan Government has been focused on the quality in preparing the teachers and the teacher education based on international standard. It implies that the teachers in Indonesia will find it difficult to shape the graduates that have a good competence standard and high-level competitiveness to face the international work world. To enhance the competence of Indonesian teachers, the future policy should be focused on the quality in the process of preparing teachers and the clear and good standard for the teachers’ competence in vocational teachers.

Keywords: government policy, vocational school teachers, teacher certification, Indonesia, Taiwan.

Introduction

Vocational school needs to have capacity of global education and work market in shaping its graduates to have good competence quality and high competitiveness and to have a role in enhancing the economy of a country (Agrawal, 2013; CISCO, 2011; Nurhadi, 2014; Slamet, 2013; UNEVOC & BIBB, 2014). One of strategies that can be done by government is through the sustainable development of teacher competence through the teacher certification (Blazer 2012; Boyd, Goldhaber, Lankford, & Wyckoff, 2007; Brown, LeNeveu, & Bourke, 2011; Clotfelter, Ladd & Vigdor, 2007; Roth & Swail, 2000). As stated in Regulations about Teacher and Lecturer (2005), teacher is a professional educator with the main tasks to learn, teach, guide, train, assess and evaluate the students in all educational levels. A professional educator or a qualified teacher will determine the school achievement and enhance the quality of graduates (AITSL, 2011).

According to European Union (2011), the teachers of vocational school play an essential role in producing the graduates to have a high level of competitiveness to compete in global market. For this, it is necessary if teacher has an industrial experience, competence to work in industry, pedagogic competence suitable and collaborative with industry. Kang, Cha, and Ha (2013) explained that the components of teacher competence that determine the student comprehension include teacher learning, teaching practice and student learning. As stated in the Regulation about Teacher and Lecturer (2005), a competent and professional teacher has four competences: pedagogy, sociality, personality and professionalism. AITSL (2011) also explains that the competence standards of professional teacher competence include knowledge, skill and expertise. Meanwhile, Training and Development Board (2007) mentions that the attributes of qualified teachers are shown by knowledge, comprehension, and skill of teachers to respond any students’ needs well and described through the content of their lesson and curriculum. In addition, the teachers need to learn about the efforts and effective strategy in the program of their learning and teaching and to use their knowledge to make a meaningful content for the students (AITSL, 2011).
The quality of professional teachers is shown in the standards of qualification and competence of the teachers (Regulation about Teacher Certification, 2007). The standard of professional teacher should have not only national standard but also international standard clearly determined and periodically evaluated. Conversely, as stated by Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development Education and Information Division (2005), uncertainty in the determination of standard of teacher competence can bring an impact on the incompetence of the graduate to compete in work market. This is in line with what has been revealed from the research of Agrawal (2013) mentioning that the graduates of vocational school in ASEAN, in view of the standard of the school that is not well prepared, are not able to fulfil the requirement standard for skilled and professional labours in global market.

Government as the policy maker needs to make some accurate policies to fulfil the quality standard of professional teacher. One improvement of teachers’ quality in Indonesia policies has been conducted through the program of education and training to improve the teachership and vocational competence (BPSPDM & PMP, 2011). In addition, the Government of Indonesia has implemented the program of teachers’ quality improvement through the education and training for teacher profession in functional position since 2007 with an expectation for a better improvement of teachers’ quality (Minister of Education, 2010).

On the other side, a critical issue regarding teachers in Indonesia commonly is that the teacher evaluation conducted by the school and government is for form’s sake to make the program runs - not oriented to the sustainable program implementation. As a consequence, the evaluation has not given any significant impact on the improvement of teachers’ quality due to the less effective and deep result of evaluation. Based on this issue, the researcher conducts a retrospective research on government policy and implementation in preparing teachers in vocational school in Indonesia. This research is also to compare the teacher preparation in Indonesia and Taiwan considering that the vocational school in Taiwan has been focused on the match of the demand for industrial workers; comprehensive maximization of students’ talent; and internationalization of all schools since 2010 (Minister of Education in Taiwan, 2011). It is expected that the result of this research can bring an input to the government in relation to the policy on teacher preparation and its implementation to make the teachers able to produce the graduates that have good competence and high competitiveness to compete in the work market at international scale.

**Government policy on teacher preparation in Indonesia and Taiwan**

Policy on the preparation of vocational school teachers in general is equally aimed to create a qualified teacher that can build the competence and competitiveness for graduates in the labour market (CISCO, 2011; Nurhadi, 2015). Khasawneh, Olimat, Qablan, and Abu-Tineh (2013) also stated that teachers are human resources that determine the student competency standards. A policy issued by the government is also based on the needs of the labour demand by industry and business (Slamet, 2013; UNIVOC & BIBB, 2014). It is expected that a professional teacher in accordance with state standards will be created and competent graduates ready to work and having high competitiveness can be achieved (Adamson, 2012).

However, the differences between two countries always exist. Based on the policy documents, the policies on teacher in Indonesia have been issued since 12 years ago with 7 policies and 1 amendment. The policies include (1) Laws on teacher and lecturer, (2) government regulation on standards of academic qualifications and teachers’ competence (3) regulation of the minister of education on teacher certification, (4) government regulations on incentives for certified teachers, (5) regulations of minister of education on teacher, (6) regulation of minister of education on in-service teacher education, and (7) regulation of the minister of education on pre-service teacher education. Amendments of policies are implemented at the minister regulations on teacher certification previously done through portfolio and education and training of the teaching profession was changed through education of in-service teacher profession in 2010, which will be implemented in 2016.

The government of Taiwan, meanwhile, has issued a policy on teacher since 38 years ago with 2 policies and 12 times for amendments. The policy is the Laws on Teacher Education and Laws on Teachers. The government is highly consistent with the changes in both laws to conform with the standard requirements necessary for a teacher by referring to the international standards of teacher. Even, the program of Minister of Education of ROC (2015) was oriented to cultivate international educational standards for all levels of education.

Differences in the policies on teacher preparation in both countries can be seen from the teacher orientation standard. Indonesian teacher is oriented to national education standards, while teachers in
Taiwan are oriented on the international education standards. This difference arises because of the character of the cultural and environmental conditions of the community (Chai, Koh, & Tsai, 2013). Indonesian culture generally behaves relaxed, less discipline, and less responsive to the science and technology development. While the culture of the people in Taiwan is discipline, time-oriented, consistent, logical, always innovative and creative, always following science and technology development, and performance-oriented international standards. Other factor is in term of the difference in the number of students and schools that later has brought an impact on the quality of service of teachers and school towards the achievement of quality competence of graduates who are ready to work in the world of work (Directorate General of Secondary Education, 2015). However, teacher preparation policies issued by the Indonesian government have increased the interest of young generation to be a teacher.

**A Strategy to Implement Government Policy for Teacher Quality in Indonesia**

The action of government to implement the policies on teacher certification is an effective strategy to strengthen the teacher quality. Since 2007, the certification program has been implemented by hosting institution for certification through two phases of activity: portfolio assessment and the education and training of the teaching profession.

Portfolio assessment refers to the recognition of teachers’ professional knowledge in the form of document assessment. The document should explain academic qualifications, education and training, teaching experience, planning and learning implementation, assessment from superiors and supervisors, academic achievement, professional development work, participation in scientific forums, experience in education and social organizations, and relevant awards in education. Teachers passing will have certification but those not passing will join the education and training of the teaching profession. The competence test is conducted at the end of the activities including: pedagogics, personality, social, and professional. Teachers who pass will have the certification, while teachers who do not pass will be given an opportunity to take the exam. If not passing the test, the teachers are still given another opportunity to join the certification program two years later.

Service in teacher certification activities is conducted by universities as the committee for accredited education program for teaching profession designated by the Ministry of Education. This program is referred to the guidelines fixed by Directorate General of Higher Education started from registration to issuing an educator certification for teacher passing the exam. Meanwhile, the quota of participants is determined by the central government and universities must report any activities to the Ministry of Education. The government also issues a policy to improve the teacher certification program.

In 2010, a new policy was issued by the government for teacher certification implemented through education programs of in-service teaching profession. Professional education is higher education after an undergraduate program that prepares teachers to have a job in accordance with the national standardized requirements for expertise to enable the teachers to have teacher certification. The purpose of professional education is to prepare professional teachers competent in planning, implementation, learning assessment and following-up assessment. Further efforts are coaching and training for teachers and conducting research and sustainable professional development. The program is planned to be implemented by 2016.

It also stated in the document of ministry of education and culture policy on the education of in-service teacher profession, the curriculum structure is composed of a group for study program education and a group for field experience with 36-40 credits for vocational high school teachers. For the group of study program education, it contains competence, strategies, methods, media, and evaluation and for the group of field experience it is about a 6-month internship conducted at school.

Meanwhile, learning program system is implemented in the form of pedagogic workshops for specific subjects, lab, and field work experience. Practicum consists of class teaching practice, micro teaching, and the study field practice. At the end of the program, competence tests include is conducted in the form of oral test and performance tests jointly conducted by hosting institutions and relevant professional organizations. Teachers passing the test will have certification of educators, while those not passing will be given another opportunity to repeat the test. If the teacher does not pass, then they can sign up for the exam in the following year. Meanwhile, the quota of the number of participants in education for teacher profession is determined by the government based on the allocated budget.

The implementation flow of the in-service teacher certification concept is based on government policy in 2007 as shown in Figure 1. Meanwhile, Figure 2 shows the plan flow of the implementation of in-service teacher education programs based on government policy in 2010 projected by 2016.
In the other hand, an effective strategy to improve the government’s policy for teacher quality is undertaken with evaluating and reviewing the policies in terms of teacher admission, teacher candidate education, teacher certification, teacher groups, and teachers’ research. The evaluation is used to improve the optimization of relevant government policies according to the needs of teacher profession development. The policies on teacher admission are made by mapping the needs, competence, and of teacher performance assessment. What is expected is the creation of appropriate and qualified admission pattern. Meanwhile, the policies on group of teachers are conducted done through the establishment of the centre for teacher optimization, group of subject teachers, and working groups of teachers. This is purposely to build self-reliance among teachers building a professional and innovative attitude in doing the roles and tasks in a better and more qualified teaching.
In general, the education for teacher candidate is necessary to prepare teachers in accordance with the standards required by the school. Also, a development in certification policies is necessary to improve the teacher certification process oriented on quality and teachers’ needs. To do so, the government needs to improve the teachers’ welfare and teachers need to boost their responsibility in carrying out their profession.

**A Strategy to Implement the Government's Policy of Teacher Quality in Taiwan**

The implementation of strategies the policy on Taiwanese teacher quality started with the certification process. To be certified, teachers need to experience some process stages: registering, teacher education, the first-phase exam to have teaching certification and the second-phase exam to have teacher certifications. The flow of teacher certification process in Taiwan is shown in Figure 3.

Figure 3 The Flow Of Teacher Certification Process in Taiwan

Taiwan government also adopts a number of other effective measures to strengthen the policy on the teachers’ quality through training programs of competence and education for advanced studies. The training program is conducted to enhance the vocational competence of teachers and education to advanced studies is conducted to improve the teacher knowledge performed at home and abroad. The Government also develops a number of information accesses to support policies in improving teacher quality through the
provision of information technology-based learning and communication such as MOOCs. An integrated e-learning database is also developed by the government to provide the data resources needed by teachers to improve their learning quality, including: reports of research results, research instruments, library, journal articles, e-books, information from seminar, and some information related to education.

Program evaluation to the implementation of policy on teacher is given by government to improve the teacher quality. Evaluation to the implementation of the policy program is conducted by university professors serving as program committee. It is annually conducted and facilitated by the central government. Its orientation is to determine the development of appropriate and effective programs to lead the quality improvement of teachers with an internationally competitive educational culture can be accomplished.

Since the last two decades, the policy on teachers in Taiwan has brought some impacts on the development of professional teachers by today society. This is because each party understands its role based on the standards required. Evaluation by the central competence association is also annually conducted to determine the learning effectiveness undertaken university through teacher education or teacher education centre. Through this evaluation, the need for the development of professional teachers can be measured and the government's vision to cultivate internationalization throughout the school levels will be achieved.

In general, the evaluation of policies on teacher certification programs, competence training programs and advanced study education is an effective strategy by the government of Taiwan to strengthen the policy on teacher quality. The evaluation is done by experts to evaluate and determine the program development accurately and effectively.

Comparing Implementation of Teacher’s Preparation in Indonesia and Taiwan

The preparation of teachers in Indonesia and Taiwan conducted by the government are based on the issued policies. The government, commonly, issued a policy on teacher preparation to acquire the qualified teachers their profession through teacher certification process. The implementation of this policy is not only influenced by the needs of teacher competency standards but also by the political conditions of the country. As an example, the quota of teachers who can follow the certification program is determined by the budget approved by the government (the Regulation of the Minister of Education on Teacher Certification, 2007).

The implementation of the teachers’ certification in Indonesia is implemented through a portfolio of education and training of teacher profession within one month. Certification is to standardize the competence of permanent teachers at national level since 2007 (Directorate General of Higher Education, 2015). This is because of the absence of standard in the previous years about to be teachers in Indonesia. Teachers passing the education and training profession will have a certificate issued by the certification committee and the certified teachers will receive incentives from the state. In 2010, the government issued a new policy on the implementation of certifications through professional education teacher in-service and pre-service. The requirement of vocational school teachers following the program of in service teaching profession education is to pass the test of teacher competency nationally organized and its implementation is planned by 2016 (Ministry of Education and Culture, 2015). On the other hand, the professional education program for pre-service teachers is intended for teachers who have attended an undergraduate program in teaching in outmost, frontier, and remote areas and its implementation has been carried out since 2013 until now (Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education, 2015).

Teacher certification program in Taiwan is designed for those from undergraduate, master, and doctoral degrees willing to be a teacher. Teacher candidates need to follow some selection processes to have teacher certification and to be a school teacher. First, the administrative documents of potential candidates are examined by a commission of competence review. Second, teacher candidates passing the administrative selection follow the teacher education within 6-12-month internship in the school. Third, the candidates with a very good value can take a written test done by the state. Teachers who pass this will receive a teaching certificate from the government. Fourth, teacher candidates can take the exam admission selection of teachers after getting a teaching certificate. When passing, the teachers will have the teacher certification and given a status as a permanent teacher (The Laws on Teacher in Republic of China, 1995).

The implementation process of teacher certification in both countries is also different. In Indonesia, the designation of teacher certification is for in-service teacher education in to have the national competency standards. In Taiwan, teacher certification is oriented to the preparation of teacher candidates who have potential and high quality enabling the teachers to increase the competencies to cultivate the internationalization of education in schools (Ministry of Education of ROC, 2014).
To improve teachers quality, effective strategies by the government is through the evaluation and the review of policy content related to teacher recruitment, teacher education, teacher certification, a group of teachers, teachers counselling, and teacher research (Carter & Keiler, 2009; Ministry of Education of ROC, 2014; Virtue, 2007). Education of advanced studies and vocational training both in domestic and in abroad are also programmed by the Taiwan government as an effort to improve the knowledge and competence of high quality corresponding to the international labour market needs. As a policy maker, government has made a creative and innovative development through the database and online-based distance learning that can be accessed by teachers (Heinen & Scriber, 2007; Segrave, Holt, & Farmer, 2005). The hosting institutions also need to improve the character of the nature and content of certification materials to support government policies on teacher certification (Perrault, 2010).

Conclusions
Based on the discussion that has been conducted on the study results, it can be concluded as follows:

1. Government policies on teacher preparation in vocational school generally have the same goal both in Indonesia and in Taiwan that is to produce the qualified and professional teachers to produce the graduates with the competence and competitiveness in the world of work (UNEVOC & BIBB, 2014; Slamet, 2013; CISCO, 2011; Agrawal, 2013). In Indonesia, the government has set the national educational standards-based teacher competence and Taiwan government has set standards based on international education. This difference is related to the different cultural and environmental conditions (Cha, 2013). However, the determination of the quality standards of teachers will impact on what extent the graduates are able to compete in the world of work nationally and internationally.

2. Overall, the implementation of government policy regarding the teacher preparation on teacher certification is different. The process of teacher certification in Indonesia is designated for in-service teachers who have not obtained certification and for pre-service teacher candidates that have attended an undergraduate program in educating in the forefront, outmost and underdeveloped area based on national standards of education (Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education, 2015). Previously, the certification was done through a portfolio and professional education and teacher training and the teaching profession changed through education (Teacher Certification Regulations, 2007; Ministry of Education and Culture, 2015). In Taiwan, teachers preparation is intended for teachers candidate who have obtained teaching certification, the implementation of which is integrated with the national teacher recruitment. Teaching certificate is obtained by the candidates after following teacher education and apprenticeship in the school within 6-12 months with a very good for final qualifying value (Laws on Teacher in Republic of China, 1995).

References
